

Revolt news286 of 5-12-09 and other issues are sent bcc and free. To subscribe or unsubscribe, simply email me or use the contact at the Revolt web site. Email addresses which fail for three consecutive issues will be removed in any case. For further information please see <<http://www.revolt.co.uk/>>.

Statements made by the editor or by other parties and quoted for information do not necessarily represent the views of Revolt. Criticism of government and industry, and grievances from members of the public, are in the nature of Revolt's work, though we try to give credit where it is due. Revolt is strictly non-party-political and regrets any offence which may be inadvertently caused.

1. More on the Rudiger-Lerchl affair (news285) appears in the article 23-11-09:

<http://www.microwavenews.com/3cases.html>

Three probity cases are summarised: Liburdy, who found power-frequency EMF effects on breast cancer cells; Lin, who argued for precaution with mobile phones; and Rudiger, who found genotoxic effects of mobile phone radiation. There is a fuller story of intrigue behind each case.

2. Microwave news 23-1-09 also comments on a new paper by Kheifets et al (with National grid authors) suggesting research on power-frequency electric field (EF), as distinct from magnetic field (MF), has reached a dead end. The paper gives a strong nudge, rather than a call, towards stopping funding: "there seems little basis for continued research into electric fields". Calls, and maybe even nudges, to stop funding research tend to look suspicious, especially when they come from such unashamedly industry-centred authors.

<http://www.microwavenews.com/junkscience.html>

http://www.powerwatch.org.uk/news/20091124_mwn_emf_fraud.asp

3. The UK SAGE group, advising on precaution for power-frequency EMFs, is looking to cut short its programme of work, as the funders recognise that it may not be providing value in terms of results, not least after the government response to the 2007 report. The scheduled meetings will go ahead into the new year, but it's future after that is uncertain.

4. Carol Vorderman has come out in support of Save Our Valley, the group fighting National Grid's proposed 400kV line near her Somerset mansion home. (Daily Mail) Recall that Revolt had, among many others, the Archbishop of York, miners' leader Arthur Scargill and national mine owner Richard Budge all on the same side against the Yorkshire line. But which campaign will get the ultimate supporter? (That's Joanna Lumley of course.)

<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/tvshowbiz/article-1232199/Carol-Vorderman-frazzle-march-pylons.html>

5. An new briefing (APPENDIX A) on underground cables (UGC) from Stirling Before Pylons was issued November 2009. It is informed by Europacables and gives helpful updates on projects and costs in other countries.

6. It is reported that construction work was halted on a giant Maryland-Virginia-West Virginia, USA, powerline after evidence citing Prof Denis Henshaw on health concerns, including research relating to melatonin, was submitted. The line is the 275-mile, 765-kV Potomac-Appalachian Transmission High-line (PATH). Big stuff! "Evidentiary hearings" are set to begin in Richmond Virginia in January, and in West Virginia in October-November 2010, for decision by February 24, 2011.

<http://www.pathtransmission.com/>

7. Correction: previous references to Hinckley Point (e.g. news284) should be to Hinkley Point (no c). The editor was too familiar with Hinckley, Leicestershire.

8. The UK Government Department DECC has issued a Draft National Policy Statement for Electricity Networks Infrastructure (EN-5) at November 2009. This National Policy Statement (NPS), taken together with the ‘Overarching National Policy Statement for Energy: A Framework Document for Planning Decisions on Nationally Significant Energy Infrastructure’ (EN-1), provides the primary basis for decisions by the Infrastructure Planning Commission (IPC) on powerline proposals. The consultation closes on Monday 22nd February 2010. Revolt and Powerwatch are studying the documentation with a view to responding.

<https://www.energynpsconsultation.decc.gov.uk/>

9. The current hoo-ha about climate change emails from University of East Anglia emphasises that scientists can at times be almost like human beings, full of partiality, conspiracy and deception. It may not be as bad as in politics, but it seems to be part of the human condition. Couple some of the emails involving the Mann-Bradley-Hughes team, of hockey-stick infamy (check wiki), with the Wegman report (news216, 239, 256, 260) comments about social networking among scientists through co-authoring and mutual refereeing, and the strains become more apparent. Such contrivances can be counter-productive, as they feed suspicion which undermines the genuine risk. An uncertain risk warranting climate precaution has been identified, but exaggerating it can do profound harm, not least to public trust in science.

10. The problem of mixing climate science with climate politics is becoming better recognised through those emails. The IPCC structure has some useful features but still fails to prevent the mixing. Perhaps it’s inevitable to some degree. In the David Nutt affair (news284.8) on drugs classification the mix is gross and obvious and should be addressed by new structures.

STIRLING BEFORE PYLONS

LESSONS FROM UNDERGROUNDING IN EUROPE : 2

November 2009



Introduction

The undergrounding of 400kV power lines, has moved on quickly over the last twelve months, with XPLE cable, rather than the old oil filled cables, now being the norm. With the decision on Beaulieu to Denny imminent we have just received the following update on the position via Europacable, the European Confederation for such technology. These developments are important, as they set a European context in which to make decisions on undergrounding for the Beaulieu to Denny line. We are supporting proposals by Scottish Natural Heritage that most of the Stirling section (23km) should be undergrounded for a variety of historical, heritage, landscape and health reasons which we have outlined elsewhere.

Germany

In Germany legislation was introduced this summer that undergrounding should be considered if a 400kV line is within 200m of individual houses or 400m of housing developments. At the time the legislation was being drawn up it was anticipated that up to half of the proposed 500km of 400kV lines in Lower Saxony could be undergrounded in 'sensitive' areas. There are now 4 pilot projects being prepared under this Enlag legislation.

Last week, 16th November, Amprion, one of the developers, gave a presentation on their proposals at a conference in Berlin. Amprion are to construct 87km of a 130km new line from Diele to Neiderhein in Lower Saxony. The other 50km will be built by Transpower and their details are currently being developed. Amprion have decided to put 14.5km underground, about 17%, this will be in 3 separate sections of 4.5, 5 and 5km. There are some interesting contrasts between this live project and the applicants for estimates for Beaulieu Denny presented at the Public Inquiry.

In Germany there will be 12 cables in two trenches containing 6 cables each. The total swathe of land required will be 16m wide. This contrasts, with the applicants for Beaulieu Denny, who stated that a 30m swathe of land would be required.

The German cable will cost 7 times more than the overhead line and 1km will cost Euro 7m. The applicants for Beaulieu Denny claimed undergrounding would be £11-14m/km or 15 times the cost.

There will be undergrounding on all 3 lines proposed in the Lower Saxony region. On the latest plans available there would be 7 separate underground sections included on the Ganderksee-St Hulfe line alone.

Clearly, undergrounding is currently seen as a justifiable and necessary solution in Germany to minimise the impacts of 400kV overhead lines.

Elsewhere

There are other examples of completed, in progress or planned underground projects :

Completed :

Copenhagen : 22km and 12km : buried in ground
Madrid Airport : 13km
England : Elstree – St Johns Wood 20km, Olympic Park 13km, Beddington 10km.

The Madrid and London cables are in tunnels due to their urban situation. In a recent document on underground technical issues the National Grid have said they would consider burial of future XLPE cable projects, which is the norm elsewhere in rural areas.

In Progress :
Conneticut : 25km

Planned :
Ranstad, Netherlands : 20km
Maasstroom, Netherlands : 13km
France/Spain Interconnector : 25km in France and 37km in Spain

Stirling

Europacable recommend selective undergrounding along a route such as Beaully Denny in the most sensitive sections. They have confirmed that it is feasible to underground the 23km as proposed in Stirling, and this was agreed by the applicants undergrounding consultants at the Public Inquiry. Such lengths require 're-active compensation', but this would be done from the sub-stations at either end of the underground section and is not a major technical issue. In their opinion, other sections of the route could technically be undergrounded if that was the desired solution of Scottish Ministers

The Scottish Government has quite rightly set out to be a world leader in renewable energy, by approving the undergrounding of the Stirling section of Beaully Denny, they could equally claim to be leaders in the transmission of that energy.

Such a solution would have the following benefits :

1. Remove the line from the most populous section of the route and in particular the the ex-mining Eastern Villages of Fallin, Pleian and Cowie. Thus removing the potential health impacts and also aid the regeneration of those communities.
2. Remove the visual impacts on the National Wallace Monument and on the iconic views of it from Stirling Castle.
3. Remove the impacts on 6km of the Ochils Area of Great Landscape Value, the only such designation which the route passes through.
4. The remove the impacts on the Sheriffmuir battlesite, the turning point in the Jacobite 1715 Uprising. This is likely to become a Listed Battlefield, when such designations are introduced in 2011.
5. The existing smaller overhead line would be removed with consequent environmental and landscape benefits.

The proposed underground route to the west of Stirling would broadly follow a route along a pipeline corridor identified in the approved Structure Plan, which already contains a gas and oil pipeline, and which could accommodate the proposed line.

This approach is unanimously supported by Stirling and Clackmannanshire Councils, Local and List MSPs, MEPs, 10 local Community Councils, as well as Scottish Natural Heritage.

For More Information contact :

Peter Pearson - Secretary : Stirling Before Pylons
01786 833399 or Peter@baker-pearson.net